

**United States District Court
District of Massachusetts (Boston)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-12217-PBS**

Ayele v. Cognisia Security Co.
Assigned to: Judge Patti B. Saris
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler
Cause: 42:2000e Job Discrimination (Employment)

Date Filed: 10/18/2004
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Begashaw Ayele

represented by **Begashaw Ayele**
816
261 O'Callaghan Way
South Boston, MA 02127
617-474-9774
PRO SE

V.

Defendant

Cognisia Security Company, Inc.

represented by **Bronwyn L. Roberts**
Duane Morris LLP
470 Atlantic Avenue
Suite 500
Boston, MA 02210
617-289-9200
Fax: 617-289-9201
Email: blroberts@duanemorris.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter B. Murphy
Duane Morris LLP
1180 West Peachtree Street
Suite 700
Atlanta, GA 30309
404-253-6900
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Terry P. Finnerty
Duane Morris LLP
1180 West Peachtree Street
Suite 700
Atlanta, GA 30309
404-253-6900
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mediator

Robert B. Collings

Mediator

Joyce L. Alexander

TERMINATED: 05/17/2005

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/18/2004	<u>1</u>	MOTION for Leave to Proceed in forma pauperis by Begashaw Ayele. (Jenness, Susan) (Entered: 10/22/2004)
10/18/2004	<u>2</u>	COMPLAINT Filing fee: \$ 0.00, receipt number 0.00, filed by Begashaw Ayele.(Jenness, Susan) (Entered: 10/22/2004)
10/18/2004	<u>3</u>	If the trial Judge issues an Order of Reference of any matter in this case to a Magistrate Judge, the matter will be transmitted to Magistrate Judge Bowler. (Jenness, Susan) (Entered: 10/22/2004)
12/16/2004	<u>3</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris : ORDER entered granting <u>1</u> Motion for Leave to Proceed in forma pauperis. The Clerk shall issue summonses and the United States Marshal shall serve a copy of the summons, complaint, and this order upon defendant(s) as directed by plaintiff with all costs of service to be advanced by the United States. (Morse, Barbara) (Entered: 12/17/2004)
12/17/2004	<u>4</u>	Summons Issued as to Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. Mailed to plaintiff with USM 285 forms, US marshal service information letter, and L.R. 4.1. (Morse, Barbara) (Entered: 12/17/2004)
12/20/2004	<u>4</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against Cognisia Security Company, Inc. , filed by Begashaw Ayele.(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 12/28/2004)
12/30/2004	<u>5</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/06/2005)
12/30/2004	<u>6</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/06/2005)
01/07/2005	<u>7</u>	NOTICE of Scheduling Conference Scheduling Conference set for 2/17/2005 04:00 PM in Courtroom 19 before Judge Patti B. Saris. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/20/2005)
01/10/2005	<u>8</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Terry P. Finnery and Peter B. Murphy Filing fee \$ 100.00, receipt number 61385, by Cognisia Security Company, Inc..(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/25/2005)
01/11/2005	<u>9</u>	US Marshal Process Receipt and Return for Summons and Complaint. Cognsia Security Co. served Delivered on 12/28/04 (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/25/2005)
01/25/2005	<u>9</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris : Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>8</u> Motion for

		Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Added Terry P. Finnerty for Cognisia Security Company, Inc., Peter B. Murphy for Cognisia Security Company, Inc. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 01/25/2005)
02/01/2005	● <u>10</u>	CERTIFICATION pursuant to Local Rule 16.1 by Cognisia Security Company, Inc..(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/09/2005)
02/01/2005	● <u>11</u>	Rule 26 Initial Disclosures by Begashaw Ayele.(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/09/2005)
02/01/2005	● <u>12</u>	NOTICE OF RESCHEDULING The Scheduling Conference previously set for 2/17/05 has been rescheduled to 2/18/2005 03:15 PM in Courtroom 19 before Judge Patti B. Saris. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/10/2005)
02/03/2005	● <u>13</u>	JOINT STATEMENT re scheduling conference. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/11/2005)
02/18/2005	●	Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Patti B. Saris: Scheduling Conference held on 2/18/2005. Court sets discovery and motion filing deadlines. Scheduling Order to issue. Court refers parties to mediation in Spring, 2005. (Court Reporter Richard Romanow.) (Alba, Robert) (Entered: 02/18/2005)
02/18/2005	● <u>14</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris : ORDER entered. REFERRING CASE to Alternative Dispute Resolution for Mediation: Spring, 2005.(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/18/2005	● <u>15</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris : ORDER entered. SCHEDULING ORDER: Fact Discovery due by 5/31/2005. Summary Judgment Motion due by 6/15/2005; opposition due by 7/15/05. Hearing on Summary Judgment or Pretrial Conference set for 7/27/2005 03:00 PM in Courtroom 19 before Judge Patti B. Saris. Case to be referred to Mediation program: Spring, 2005. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/28/2005	●	Notice of assignment to ADR Provider. Mag. Judge Robert B. Collings appointed as mediator. The court will contact the parties about scheduling mediation.(Nee, Amy) (Entered: 02/28/2005)
03/10/2005	● <u>16</u>	MOTION for Filing Plaintiff's Papers without Electronic System by Begashaw Ayele.(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 03/18/2005)
03/25/2005	●	Notice of assignment to ADR Provider. This case is reassigned to Mag. Judge Joyce L. Alexander as mediator. The court will contact the parties about scheduling mediation.(Nee, Amy) (Entered: 03/25/2005)
03/25/2005	●	Judge Patti B. Saris : Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>16</u> Motion for Filing Plaintiff's Papers without Electronic System (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 03/30/2005)
04/25/2005	● <u>17</u>	NOTICE of ADR Conference Alternative Dispute Resolution Hearing set for 5/16/2005 10:00 AM in Courtroom 24 before Magistrate Judge Joyce London Alexander. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> ADR Brochure)(Brown, Rex) Modified on 4/26/2005 (Patch, Christine). (Entered: 04/25/2005)

04/25/2005	●	Notice of correction to docket made by Court staff. Correction: Docket entry 4/25/05 corrected because: To correct the docket a second time to indicate that the mediation set for 5/16/05 at 10:00 AM has been properly set. (Brown, Rex) (Entered: 04/25/2005)
05/11/2005	● <u>19</u>	Plaintiff's Position STATEMENT. Note: Exhibits not scanned. (Patch, Christine) Modified on 5/19/2005 (Patch, Christine). (Entered: 05/19/2005)
05/16/2005	●	Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Joyce London Alexander : Hearing re MEDIATION held on 5/16/2005. (Tape #N/A.) (Brown, Rex) (Entered: 05/17/2005)
05/17/2005	● <u>18</u>	REPORT of Alternative Dispute Resolution Provider. This case should be restored to your trial list. (Brown, Rex) (Entered: 05/17/2005)
05/26/2005	● <u>20</u>	MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 05/26/2005)
05/26/2005	● <u>21</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 05/26/2005)
05/31/2005	● <u>22</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to 9/30/05 to File Answer to as to <u>20</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> and to Take Deposition from Defendant, by Begashaw Ayele.(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 06/02/2005)
05/31/2005	● <u>23</u>	MOTION for Permission to Use One of the Court's Conference Rooms for Taking Deposition from Defendant Cognsia Security Inc, et al by Begashaw Ayele. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 06/02/2005)
06/07/2005	● <u>24</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris: ORDER entered REFERRING case to Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler for Full Pretrial Case management, not including Dispositive Motions, and <u>22</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to 9/30/05 to File Response/Reply as to <u>20</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Begashaw Ayele, <u>23</u> MOTION for Permission to Use One of the Court's Conference Rooms for Taking Deposition from Defendant Cognsia Security Inc, et al filed by Begashaw Ayele.(Alba, Robert) (Entered: 06/07/2005)
06/08/2005	● <u>25</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>22</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to 9/30/05 to File Response/Reply as to <u>20</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/08/2005)
06/08/2005	● <u>26</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>23</u> MOTION for Permission to Use One of the Court's Conference Rooms for Taking Deposition from Defendant Cognsia Security Inc, et al filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/08/2005)
06/09/2005	●	NOTICE of Hearing: Status Conference set for 6/28/2005 at 2:30 PM in

		Courtroom 25 before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler. (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 06/09/2005)
06/15/2005	●27	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/15/2005)
06/15/2005	●28	MEMORANDUM in Support re 27 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/15/2005)
06/15/2005	●29	STATEMENT of facts re 27 MOTION for Summary Judgment. (Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/15/2005)
06/17/2005	●30	Opposition re 20 MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Begashaw Ayele. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 06/22/2005)
06/24/2005	●	Mail Returned as Undeliverable. Mail sent to Peter B. Murphy (Catino, Theresa) (Entered: 06/24/2005)
06/27/2005	●31	REPLY to Response to Motion re 20 MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 06/27/2005)
06/29/2005	●	Electronic clerk's notes for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Status conference and motion hearing for 22 Motion for Extension of Time to 9/30/05 to File Response/Reply as to 20 Motion to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Begashaw Ayele, 23 Motion for Permission to Use One of the Court's Conference Rooms for Taking Deposition from Defendant Cognisia Security Inc, et al filed by Begashaw Ayele and 20 Motion to Compel <i>Discovery</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.; The court hears argument on the motions and rules on the motions in open court; Discovery is to close by 8/5/2005 to allow the pltf. to take four depositions; The pltf. is to respond to the def't.'s motion for summary judgment by 8/19/2005; A status conference is set for 9/8/2005 at 10:30 AM.(Tape #Digital.) (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 06/29/2005)
07/01/2005	✓ ●	Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Electronic ORDER entered granting 20 Motion to Compel as to parts (a) (b) (c) and denying without prejudice as to part (d); granting 22 Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to the extent that discovery is extended until August 5, 2005, for the sole purpose of taking the depositions of Nicole Downs, Aaron Field, Gary Feldman and George Cintrol and, finding as moot 23 Motion, in light of defendant's willingness to provide a conference room for the depositions. (Bowler, Marianne) (Entered: 07/01/2005)
07/05/2005	●32	MOTION to Quash Subpoena by Compliance Network of New England . (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Subpoena)(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 07/08/2005)
07/07/2005	●33	Opposition re 27 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Begashaw Ayele. Please note: Exhibits not scanned. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 07/07/2005)

		07/11/2005)
07/07/2005	● <u>36</u>	MOTION for Compelling Discovery on Third Party by Begashaw Ayele. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Amended Subpoena# <u>2</u> Errata Letter to John Quintal# <u>3</u> Exhibit Motion to Quash Subpoena)(Patch, Christine) (Entered: 07/12/2005)
07/11/2005	● <u>34</u>	MOTION to Quash <i>Subpoena Served On Compliance Network</i> by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 07/11/2005)
07/12/2005	● <u>35</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris: ORDER entered REFERRING <u>34</u> Emergency MOTION to Quash <i>Subpoena Served On Compliance Network</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc., to Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler(Alba, Robert) (Entered: 07/12/2005)
07/12/2005	●	NOTICE of Hearing; <u>32</u> and <u>34</u> Motion to Quash <i>Subpoena Served On Compliance Network</i> : Motion hearing set for 7/20/2005 at 2:30 PM in Courtroom 25 before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler. (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 07/12/2005)
07/13/2005	● <u>37</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris: ORDER entered REFERRING <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc., to Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler for Report and Recommendation. (Alba, Robert) (Entered: 07/13/2005)
07/14/2005	● <u>38</u>	Opposition re <u>34</u> MOTION to Quash <i>Subpoena Served On Compliance Network</i> , <u>32</u> MOTION to Quash filed by Begashaw Ayele. (York, Steve) (Entered: 07/18/2005)
07/19/2005	● <u>39</u>	Opposition re <u>36</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Discovery On Third Party</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 07/19/2005)
07/20/2005	●	Electronic clerk's notes for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Motion hearing held on 7/20/2005; <u>34</u> Motion to Quash <i>Subpoena Served On Compliance Network</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc. and <u>32</u> Motion to Quash filed by Compliance Network of New England; Begashaw Ayele, pro se, Bronwyn Roberts for the deft. and John Quintal, president of Compliance Network of New England appearing without counsel; The court hears argument on docket entry <u>34</u> and makes a ruling in open court; The court also rules on docket entry <u>32</u> in open court. (Tape #Digital.) (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 07/21/2005)
07/21/2005	●	ADMINISTRATIVE ENTRY BY COURT STAFF. Please take note that the July 27, 2005, Summary Judgment Hearing before Judge Patti Saris is cancelled. The Motion for Summary Judgment has been referred to Magistrate Judge Bowler. (Alba, Robert) (Entered: 07/21/2005)
07/22/2005	●	Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Electronic ORDER entered finding as moot <u>32</u> Motion to Quash, granting in part and denying in part <u>34</u> Motion to Quash, that portion of the motion relating to attorney's fees is denied

		without prejudice to being renewed at the conclusion of the case and denying <u>36</u> Motion to Compel. (Bowler, Marianne) (Entered: 07/22/2005)
07/29/2005	● <u>40</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 07/29/2005)
08/01/2005	● <u>41</u>	MOTION to Quash <i>And For A Protective Order</i> by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Roberts, Bronwyn) (Entered: 08/01/2005)
08/02/2005	● <u>42</u>	Judge Patti B. Saris: ORDER entered REFERRING <u>41</u> Emergency MOTION to Quash <i>And For A Protective Order</i> filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc., to Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler.(Alba, Robert) (Entered: 08/02/2005)
08/02/2005	●	NOTICE of Hearing on Motion <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment: Motion hearing set for 9/15/2005 at 10:15 AM in Courtroom 25 before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler. (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 08/02/2005)
08/02/2005	●	Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Electronic ORDER entered granting the relief sought in parts (i) and (ii) of the final paragraph of the <u>41</u> Motion to Quash. The relief sought in part (iii) is denied without prejudice to be renewed at the conclusion of the case. (Bowler, Marianne) (Entered: 08/02/2005)
08/02/2005	●	Remark: The status conference set for 9/8/2005 at 10:30 AM will not be held due to the scheduling of the motion hearing set for 9/15/2005 at 10:15 AM. (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 08/02/2005)
08/04/2005	● <u>43</u>	Opposition re <u>41</u> MOTION to Quash <i>And For A Protective Order</i> filed by Begashaw Ayele. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 08/09/2005)
08/04/2005	● <u>44</u>	REPLY to Response to <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Begashaw Ayele. (Patch, Christine) (Entered: 08/09/2005)
09/15/2005	●	Electronic clerk's notes for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler: Motion hearing held on 9/15/2005; <u>27</u> Motion for Summary Judgment filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc.; Begashaw Ayele, pro se and Bronwyn Roberts for the deft.; The court hears argument on the motion and takes the matter under advisement. (Digital Recorder #10:15 AM-10:45 AM.) (Saccoccio, Dianalynn) (Entered: 09/15/2005)
10/17/2005	● <u>45</u>	Judge Marianne B. Bowler: ORDER entered. REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS re <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Cognisia Security Company, Inc., Recommendation: Allowed Objections to R&R due by 10/31/2005(Feeney, Eileen) (Entered: 10/17/2005)